

**Aamir Cheema**

[aamircheema@outlook.com](mailto:aamircheema@outlook.com)

03025478100

## **Research Proposal**

### **Causes of Violence on North West Frontier- A Case Study of North Waziristan Agency**

Sapere Aude {dare to know} , *have courage to use your own reason*, this is the motto of Enlightenment{ Immanuel Kant { 1724-1804} <sup>i</sup> , }.

#### **Introduction**

The quest of human to know themselves is as old as the history of mankind itself, even the creation of earth is by itself is a classic research model created by the god, in which he took six days to create the earth, and rested on seventh day. God created light, water, plants, day and night, sun and moon, animals. From the research model clay , god created Adam {man} and from his ribs created Eve {woman} , both were placed inside the garden of Aden , with a restriction that Adam can do anything less eating from one specific tree. Eve was instigated by the snake in disobeying the commandment of god, ‘ this fruit will give you wisdom’ in turn Eve persuaded Adam to eat the forbidden fruit, which Adam despite the instructions did. God resultantly threw both out of heaven<sup>ii</sup>. From present sociology perspective<sup>1</sup>, the point of interest is why god, forbidden the fruit in first instance Later Cain and Abel the two very first offspring of Adam and Eve were involved in the very first murder or act of violence.<sup>2</sup> In the aforementioned gospel, there is no evidence which can prove the narrative yet half of present day

---

<sup>1</sup> James Coleman,, *Foundations of Social Theory*. Cambridge: Harvard University,1990

<sup>2</sup> killing of Abel by the Cain was instigated by the refusal of god to accept the gifts of Cain whereas god accepted the gifts of Abel, thus killing and murder of Abel had the causal element in the very refusal of god himself

world population believes on it<sup>iii</sup>. This study of man as why he resorts to violence and what are the causes of violence, generates hypothesis and theories.<sup>iv 3</sup>

## 1. Scarlet Thread

War on Terror with passing of time has become ‘war with tribes’.<sup>4</sup> The main theatre of operation against the terrorists since 9/11 is focussed along or in the adjoining tribal areas<sup>5</sup> of Pakistan’s western frontier which runs along the crest of Hindu Kush Range known as Durand Line<sup>6</sup>, and even in it the North Waziristan Agency stands out as being the most dangerous<sup>7</sup>. The historical similarity<sup>8</sup> are too identical to be avoided, in 1936 a military operation was initiated in the North Waziristan Agency with a single aim to capture Mirza Ali Khan Tori Khel of Uthmanzais Wazirs known as Fakir of Ipi and it failed to do so till 1960 when Fakir of Ipi died of natural death with his grave still a mystery.<sup>9</sup> In present time, the war primarily started with one single aim to hunt Osama Bin Laden, who again like Fakir of Ipi was believed to be hiding in the same agency<sup>10</sup>; he was finally killed in 2011 at Abbottabad, like Ipi his grave and death is still an enigma.

---

<sup>3</sup> Theology on other hand is the study of divinity.

<sup>4</sup> Brigadier Sajjad Ahmed, 2012, *Terrorism and Extremism in Pakistan post 9/11 reappraisal and the way forward*, { M.Phil. Thesis, , p-92, National Defence University, Islamabad. Till 2012, a total of 37,888 casualties including 3974 security forces, 11,809 Civilian, and 22105 insurgents. Also see Dr Khan Muhammad ‘ISAF, Afghanistan & Pakistan; Challenges and Opportunities’, *Marghalla Papers Islamabad*, 2012.

<sup>5</sup> These seven political agencies are collectively known as Federal Administered Tribal Areas {FATA} having over two dozen tribes inhabiting it, most notable are Wazir, Afridi, Mahsud, Turi, Orakzai, Mohmand. Minor tribes include Shinwari, Daur and Shilman. Its not merely the population but the ownership of land and the martial history which distinguishes a tribe from other. Also see Constitution of Pakistan for status of Tribal Areas

<sup>6</sup> The Durand Line Agreement between Abdur Rehman and Mortimer Durand was signed on November 12, 1893, which formulated the formal borders between British India and Afghanistan. The Durand Line extends approximately 1400 miles from the Sarikol range in the north to the Afghanistan border in the southwest. The treaty was rectified in 1905, 1919, 1920 and 1921 with certain amendments, there were minor adjustments. For more detail see American Institute of Afghan Studies “The Durand Line: History, Consequences and Future.” Nov 2007. <http://www.hollingscenter.org/Reports/07-2007>, Hayat, Azmat, *The Durand Line Its Geo-Strategic Importance*. Islamabad : Pan Graphics, 2000.

<sup>7</sup>, President Obama’s remarks on a new strategy for Afghanistan and Pakistan, White House office of the press secretary, 27 March 2009, [www.whitehouse.gov/the\\_press\\_office/Remarks-by-the-President-o..](http://www.whitehouse.gov/the_press_office/Remarks-by-the-President-o..)

<sup>8</sup> Historical repetition , what is repeated is not the event itself but rather the structure, thus repetition of events occupies a major philosophical framework, for more see Karen Katajin *History and Repetition*, ed, Seiji M Lippi, {New York: Columbia University, 2012}

<sup>9</sup> Fakir of Ipi’s grave is at Gurweikht, western end of Tochi valley inside a cave but no funeral was ever held at time of death and even exact location is uncertain.

<sup>10</sup> In the public and in the military circles the prevailing mind set was , that Osama is hiding in North Waziristan Agency. Also see Mustafa Hamid, Farrall, Leah. *The Arabs at War in Afghanistan*. {London: Hurst & Company, 2015}. Also see Armed Forces War Course 2004-05, Military History presentation by Brigadier Muhammad Farooq *War Against Terror and Coalition Operations in Afghanistan*. National Defence University Islamabad.

Thus logically, it is failure to learn from the History<sup>11</sup> which has prolonged the present campaign in North Waziristan.

## 2. Literature Review

The present and existing literature<sup>12</sup> on North Waziristan, War on Terror and FATA falls into following major categories and themes. First, written by British officials between 1830-1947, conveys a *Romance of Frontier*. Second, the American scholars relying more upon the theoretical framework drawn upon the experience of Malay, Vietnam, Sri Lanka, Middle East's asymmetric wars, can be summarised as *Deductive Idealism*: Pakistan being the hub of the International terrorism, bastion of militancy, Islam as the primary factor in the increase of violence all over the globe, Pakistan's military being implicated in the support of the militants<sup>13</sup>. The conclusion of native scholars is towards highlighting the lack of infrastructure, facilities and education {*Marxism, economic disparity*}. However scholars world over have either over looked or misinterpreted the concept of *Qaum, Watan and Riwaj*. It is this misinterpretation {ontology} which resultantly makes every rebel, anarchist, revoloutanry, guerrilla, criminal, in the political agency into more commonly accepted perception as a Taliban or terrorist or a militant.<sup>14</sup>

*Qaum*{nation} conveys a strong sense of bondage in which every man is identified with his clan and to his tribe, the area occupied by the tribe is *Watan*, which in Western mechanics is equal to a state, whereas the *Riwaj*{culture} is the Magna Carta of these tribes, the unwritten laws and customs which every individual is bound to adhere and around which the *Watan* and *Qaum* revolves. The misinterpretation lies in the two different sets of structures and norms, it is like looking at the world from two eyes each having a different point of focus. Whereas modern civilisation including Pakistan adheres to the Western concept of statehood, law, morality, regulations, international relations and as such all the organs of state, {bureaucracy, military, social norms, living pattern} are structured according to international norms; the tribes especially the Wazir are adhering to ancient traditions and their geography and habitat apart from social norms have fundamentally remained unchanged since the time of Old Testament and as such Wazir are an ancient civilisation, most probably Aryan. One of the key error is taking all the tribal areas as one single geographical entity in the form of FATA, there by relegating all tribes as one tribal unity.

---

<sup>11</sup> History as a concept and term is a European perspective, a Greek creation, see Donald Kelly, *Faces of Historical Inquiry from Herodotus to Herder* {London: Yale University, 1998}, p-3. Main debate is whether to consider History a science or an art, for more see, Arnold Jhonson *The Historian and Historical Evidence* {NewYork: Charles Scribner, 1926}, p-9.

<sup>12</sup> In the Literature review, the books, articles and unpublished thesis at Ph.D and Mphil have been consulted, there is no specific study on North Waziristan Agency, although few thesis are on Khyber Agency, for more see ETHOS a collection of thesis of British Universities. [ethos.bl.uk/](http://ethos.bl.uk/)

<sup>13</sup>, British Prime Minister David Camerron accused Pakistan of 'looking both ways', <http://www.theguardian.com/politics/2010/jul/28/david-cameron-india-pakistan-terror>

<sup>14</sup> Taliban a Persian word denotes student, or more precisely a seeker of religious knowledge, the term was mentioned in 1929 report of political agent North Waziristan Agency while describing a killer who had committed a honour killing, he was a talib in local seminary. *Miranshah Archives*.

Samuel Huntington's *Clash of Civilisation*<sup>15</sup> read in the background of Mackinder's *Geographical Pivot of History*<sup>16</sup>, Turner's *Frontier Thesis*<sup>17</sup> along with Lord Curzon's on *Indian Frontier*<sup>18</sup> and a picture emerges in which the Indus civilisation is at the heart of Geographical Pivot of history, nature has placed three great civilisation at one source and as such the concept of frontier emerges which is abstract in nature but defines the overlay of civilisation. Culture and Civilisation<sup>19</sup> are two inherent overlapping threads which tends to explain a new paradigm in International relations

Frontiers are the undefined extent of sovereignty, it is abstract in nature as unlike boundary, Frontiers are not marked humanly rather it is the geography which draws the Frontiers between the civilisations, e.g.; Pamir watershed draws the line of Frontiers between the Oxus and Indus, or between the mountainous and the plain civilisation. Frontier Civilisation thus is a combination of Oxus and Indus civilisations; Indus Frontier hereby defines the political as well as the geographical extent of British Raj in past and now Pakistan.

Civilisation took birth along the rivers, each valley{river} of Indus civilisation have its own *Culture* {rituals, customs and traditions} influenced by the geography, thus Indus Civilisation comprise of different cultures. *Indus Valley is a Martial Civilisation*, is one of the major deduction from the Alexander The Great's campaign with Indus Civilisation, which later on embraced Islam. Religion further fuelled the militancy through the edicts and interpretation. most notably Mahmood of Ghazna's {1000 AD} campaign against the Hindus and later Tamerlane's holocaust {1302 AD}. Waziristan emerged at this point in history, they were part of Mahmood's force and Tamerlane exited Indus Valley through Tochi Valley. Later during the Mughul period of rule, Waziristan remained obscure, Frontier was never peaceful in entity during the three hundred years, Mughuls major contribution is that they kept Kabul as part and subservient to the Agra and later Delhi.

British East India Company from 1600 AD onwards brought new civilisation and its philosophy, based upon the Island mind-set, western political thoughts or *Machiavellian Model*. Western language, dress code, eating habits, living pattern soon became the guiding light for social progress. In 1947 Indus and Ganges civilisation were divided on historical and geographical basis into two states, Pakistan and

---

<sup>15</sup> [Huntington, Samuel P.](#), *The Clash of Civilizations?*, in "[Foreign Affairs](#)", vol. 72, no. 3, Summer 1993, pp. 22–49. also see by same author *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*, New York, Simon & Schuster, 1996.

<sup>16</sup> Mackinder, H.J., "[The Geographical Pivot of History](#)", *The Geographical Society*, Vol. 23, No.4, (April 1904), 421-437

<sup>17</sup> [The Frontier In American History](#) the original 1893 essay by Turner

<sup>18</sup> Lord Curzon Viceroy of India 1899-1905, the man who raised the North Western Frontier Province and also the Militia, his writings are the foremost and pioneer on Frontier see Lord Curzon *On The Indian Frontier*, ed, Dhara Anjaria {Karachi: Oxford, 2012.} also see Curzon, Lord. 'Frontier' in *Oxford Lectures on History 1904-1923 Ten Volumes in One*. USA: Free Library, 1924. [George N. Curzon](#) *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 8, No. 1 (Jul., 1896), pp. 15-5

<sup>19</sup> Civilisation, a state of human society which is highly developed, a society, its culture and its way of life at a particular period of time or in a particular part of world. Culture on the other hand is escribed as way of life, and social organisation of particular country or group {Oxford advanced learner's dictionary of current English, seventh edition}

India, as a result of Two Nation Theory on religious basis. Pakistan inherited the Frontier as well, within Pakistan existed two distinct civilisations, one a western, mostly on east of Indus {Punjab} and other medieval or eastern on the west of Indus.

## Thesis & Dissertations

There are 245 thesis in National Defence University Islamabad, out of which a dozen deals with the tribal areas of Pakistan or more specifically FATA, yet not a single paper or research paper is on Militia or on Frontier Corps. Among the sixty odd thesis of foreign universities mainly USA and Canada the term FATA is being used exclusively for all the tribal areas. The general perception that emerges from these thesis is ‘ FATA and tribal areas are ungovernable, the state of Pakistan intentionally avoids doing anything in tribal areas, the safe haven of terrorist and al Qaeda are in these tribal areas, the lack of education and economical disparities are the major reason for the present state of situation, women and human rights have no standing in these tribal areas, war in Afghanistan cannot be won unless and until these tribal areas are incorporated in the main stream of government. Among the scholars, only has been in Pakistan from University of Austin Texas, others relied mainly on theoretical framework of conflict theories. Women scholars have their bias on highlighting the plight of women in the tribal society.

## 3. Research Inquiry

The fundamental inquiry is, **North Waziristan Agency**, *it is the enigma to be explored, as to why it has gain so much notoriety in terms of violence, why it is what it is; most dangerous place on earth?*. And it leads into Militia {Scouts, & Rifles} *represents the cultural and military icon of political agencies, what is their impact on the native tribes, whether these organisations reduce the conflict or aggravate it?* And logically the conclusion, *What is true in North Waziristan Agency in the past and present , will it hold true in future as well?*.

## 4. Historicism as Theory

History<sup>20</sup> is the science of the past<sup>v</sup>. There are two main school of thoughts prevailing in the world, one which believe in laws of nature in absolute form, in which a future behaviour of any particular object can be predicted with uniformity<sup>vi</sup>, for example water boils at certain temperature, warm air rises no matter whether it is Germany or in Chitral same holds true for ‘laws of gravity’ thus any object will fall at a standard rate all across the globe. On the other hand such laws cannot be applied to human behaviour universally, as a matter of fact there is no ‘law of science’ which can be applied on humans other than that every human has to die irrespective of his knowledge, power and wealth. they are known as or labelled as Anti Naturalistic or negative, on the other hand those who believe in the laws of physics and its applicability in all fields are termed as Naturalistic or positive.<sup>vii</sup>. Thus whereas the flight path of a bullet fired from a rifle can be predicted with accuracy all over the world, the behaviour of the firer can only be hypothesised .

History<sup>21</sup> on the literary and dictionary level is study of past, record of past events ‘all the events that happened in past’<sup>viii</sup>, ‘a branch of knowledge dealing with past events, a connected and continuous account of previous happenings ordinarily presented in chronological order’<sup>ix</sup> and the craft of writing History is known as Historiography<sup>x</sup>, however the term historiography ‘the rhetoric of history’ ‘history writing’ is being used synonymously.<sup>22</sup> History is also a theory, we are more interested in those acts of pasts which have importance today as well,<sup>xi</sup> History is never constructed from narratives but from documents<sup>xii</sup>, it is one view and other is that history can be constructed rather it is present irrespective of the documents.<sup>xiii</sup>. History as a concept and term is a European perspective<sup>23</sup>, a Greek creation, historians have been fascinated by the questions of origins. Like philosophy, history concerned itself with questions of cause and effects. History has a pattern that could be explained.

---

<sup>20</sup> George Wilhelm Hegel *The Philosophy of History* Great books Of Western World, Robert Maynard Hutchins editor, London, Encyclopaedia Britannica, 1952., Peter T Mancs *A History & Philosophy of The Social sciences*, 1987, Basil Blackwell, Oxford. P-62.

<sup>21</sup> Historiness is a German word translated into English as Historicism, see Jerry Butler Ed, *The Oxford Handbook of World History* {Oxford, 2011}, p-26.

<sup>22</sup> Anthony Marwick *The Nature of History* {New York; Alfred Knopf, 1971} p-32. Also see Arnaldo Momigliano *Essays in Ancient and Modern Historiography* {Connecticut: Wesleyan University, 1975} and his other work *Studies in Historiography* {New York; Harper, 1966}. Benedict Croce *History, its Theory and Practice* translated by Douglas Ainslie {New York; Russel & Russel, 1960}. Agnes Hellen *A Theory of History* {London; Routledge & Kegan, 1982}

<sup>23</sup> Donald Kelley, *Faces of History, Historical inquiry from Herodotus to Herder*. {London: Yale university Press, 1998}, p-3.

Karl Raymond Popper<sup>24</sup> coins the term Historicism<sup>xiv</sup>, as approach to the social science which assumes that ‘Historical Prediction’ is their principal aim and this can be attained by discovering the rhythm, pattern, laws, or trends that underline the evolution of society. The debate is that whether history can bring predictions like physical sciences. Anti-Naturalistic Doctrine of Historicism, they believe or claim that some of the characteristics of Physics methods cannot be applied to the social sciences, Physical laws or the laws of nature are valid anywhere and always, on the other hand sociological laws or laws of social life, differ in different places of and periods. All social groups have their own traditions, their own institutions their own rites. Historicism claims that we must study the history of the groups, its traditions and institutions, if, we wish to understand and perhaps to foresee, its future development. We must try to understand intuitively the history of the various social groups, it is the doctrine. Popper highlights that it is important for the social scientist to understand the larger aspect of the action, such as raising of new army in a certain country, it is necessary to analyse the intentions, interest and so forth. Essence or the real character of a social group can reveal itself and be known, only through its history.

Collingwood stated that ‘every historian would agree, I think that history is a kind of research or enquiry’. Collingwood<sup>25</sup>’s own idea of philosophy of history is a ‘philosophical inquiry into the nature of history’ {pp,1-7} history is a kind of research or inquiry, science is finding things out and in that sense history is a science, object of history is to ‘action of human beings that have been done in the past’. Karl Marx the very man whose writing and ideas ignited a chain of violence in last century was a firm believer of history, but to him history was a struggle of classes<sup>26</sup>. asserted that historical events have natural cause. The philosophy of history

---

<sup>24</sup> Popper wrote much influenced *The Poverty of Historicism* {London,Routledge,1957}. W. A. Suchting (1972) *Marx, popper, and ‘historicism’*, Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy, 15:1-4, 235-266, DOI:[10.1080/00201747208601662](https://doi.org/10.1080/00201747208601662). Bertrand Russell *Human Knowledge its scope and limits*, {George Allen and Unwin, New York},1966,p-9.

<sup>25</sup> Richard Collingwood is regarded as an influential historian, his work *Idea of History*{Oxford,1956} is primarily comprised of his lectures delivered in 1936. Also see Collingwood Richard ‘The Nature and aim of a Philosophy of History’ first published in 1924-1925 in *Essays in the Philosophy of History* {University of Texas:1967},p.36. Dray William, *History as Re-Enactment R.G. Collingwood’s idea of history*. Oxford University, 1995.P-32.

Another major work on History is by Vico{1668-1744} who gave it the name of ‘New Science’.

<sup>26</sup> ‘The history of all hitherto existing societies is the history of class struggle’ are the opening sentences of his much famed work *Communist Manifesto* in 1848.

therefore is the study of historical thinking, not only the psychological analysis of its actual procedure but the analysis of the ideal which it sets before itself<sup>xv</sup> Philosophy is thinking about the world as a whole, to study the nature of selected parts of the world is to be scientist; to study its nature as a whole is to be philosopher.<sup>xvi</sup> In History, inquiry does not strictly bind itself to the scientific model of investigation; historian is in most instances searching for the unique and particular case, not for the general and universally applicable principle or law. His goal is less to verify or refute a hypothesis and more to reconstruct the past as accurately as possible. Historical facts are not manna, facts are worthless unless someone does something with them and the job of historic is to make them tell the truth as fully as possible, historian based his work upon facts but he also recognizes the problems attached to them. In science, theory is supported by general laws, however in history, there are no general laws. There are exceptions, as Arnold Toynbee's theory of civilisation 'which broadly consist of numerous hypothesis and generalisation'<sup>xvii</sup>. . Thus, historians' statements are defensible empirically and to discover the meaning of the facts then to infer the causal relationship, this takes the form of hypothesis, to advance historical explanations, a truthful narrative and define history<sup>xviii</sup>. There are few fundamental school of thoughts as far as the Historical research is concerned, these paradigms are Marxist, Modernization which includes Durkheim and Weber, the Annales School<sup>27</sup> and finally the Identity Politics especially in USA. Culturist theorist insists that culture has its own meanings, own autonomous logic, language and cultural expressions that shape the social world.<sup>xix</sup>.

Our modern research culture and philosophy is based upon the Positivism, a research which has a scientific infrastructure ,where results can be tested mathematically or scientifically Positivism<sup>28</sup> may be defined as the philosophy acting in the service of natural science; they ascertain facts and secondly framing laws , the laws are farmed through generalisation from facts

---

<sup>27</sup> The Annales School emerged in France in 1930-40, focussing on pre industrial societies, the main founder was Marck Bloch, Lucier Febvre and Ferdinand Braudel. They aimed at directing history away from merely battles , treaties towards the social life , society, social groups and on collective narrative . Annales School of historian believe that environment climatic and demography shapes human activity in a fundamental way. Since these factors change slowly over long periods of time neither revolution nor any other kind of short term political change concern them .

<sup>28</sup> }. Giambattista Vico {1668-1774} born in Naples , wrote New science {1725}, in which he propounded the a 'Cyclic theory of History' in which human nations passes through inevitably certain distinguishable stages of development, he believed that unlike world of natural object about which the God alone knows , the world of nations or human history has in fact been created by men and is there fore something which men can hope to know,



by induction this is known as the Positivist Historiography.<sup>29</sup> Auguste Comte{1798-1857} proposed that there should be a new science called sociology, which was to begin by discovering the facts about human life and then go on to discover the causal connexions between these facts. *Positivism*<sup>30</sup> is the scientific method which ensure scientific experimentation capable of providing knowledge about cause-effect –relationship. Positivism is a commitment to determinism, it also requires empiricism. ‘*So that he {researcher} must consequently be on his guard against first impressions*’.<sup>31</sup> ...indeed our main objective is to extend the scope of scientific rationalism to cover human behaviour by demonstrating that in light of the past, it is capable of being reduced relationship of cause and effect... what has been termed as our positivism is merely a consequence of this rationalism.

Aristotle wrote ‘All men by nature desire to know<sup>xx</sup>, from memory, experience is produced ...and experience seems pretty much like science and art, but really science and art comes to men through experience...since we are seeking this knowledge we must inquire of what kind are the causes and the principles...evidently, we have to acquire knowledge of the original causes and causes are spoken in four senses<sup>xxi</sup>. Aristotle further stated that ‘investigation of truth in one way hard, in another easy, an indication of this is found in the fact that no one is able to attain the truth adequately’.<sup>xxii</sup>

Historical inquiry does not strictly bind itself to the scientific model of investigation, historian is in most instances searching for the unique and particular case, not for the general and universally applicable principle or law. His goal is less to verify or refute a hypothesis and more to reconstruct the past as accurately as possible.<sup>32</sup> The goal of the observer is to link the observed facts with more general statements and to reduce the number of general statements to a

---

<sup>29</sup> Historiography at its highest level of originality may attempt an enquiry which former generators called philosophy of history in an application at a lower level it is deep structured inquiry until around 1700, the idea of a period of history designating a stretch of time with an internal unity and more importantly the notion of ‘source’ understood as composing one of the elements out of which a historical text might flow, just as river originates in its source, William Robertson seems to have been the first to use the word in that sense in 1777, he was principal of Edinburgh University

<sup>30</sup> Auguste Comte{1798-1857}, used the term Positivism, Few other famous Positivists are Rene Descartes {1596-1650} Issac Newton {1642-1727}, Voltaire {1694-1778}, Rousseau {1712-1778} he wrote Social Contract {1762}, Kant {1724-1801} he asked ‘What is enlightenment? And Ibn Khaldun {1337-1406}, Durkheim *The Rules of Sociological Method and selected Texts on Sociology and its Method*, edited Steven Lukes, Translated W.D.Halls. London, Macmillan, 1982.<sup>31</sup> P-31, written in preface

<sup>32</sup> Arnold Jhonson. *The Historian and historical Evidence*. NewYork: Charles Scribner 1926, pp-31-33.

system of the fewest numbers of the statements sufficient to account for the phenomena with which one is concerned.<sup>33</sup> Comte presented direct observation experimentations and comparison as the specific observational methods, he cautioned direct observers to apply a specific theoretical viewpoint, test their results to vague and incoherent...research might focus on occurrences as social customs, forms of languages and collectively erected monuments.<sup>34</sup>

The Annales School emerged in France in 1930-40, focussing on pre industrial societies, the main founder was Marck Bloch, Lucier Febvre and Ferdinand Braudel. They aimed at directing history away from merely battles , treaties towards the social life , society, social groups and on collective narrative {p-16}. Annales School of historian believe that environment climatic and demography shapes human activity in a fundamental way. Since these factors change slowly over long periods of time neither revolution nor any other kind of short term political change concern them {p-17}.

In order to predict about the future events in North Waziristan Agency, Historicism has to be ascertained empirically and then taking year 1900 as the start point, because it was in this year that the political agency and its militia, North Waziristan Militia were both raised. Violence is taken as the core factor in the politics, the number of fatal casualties taking place in the agency. What were the causes in the past for the violence and then comparing past and present in order to build a logical inductive deduction.

North Waziristan Militia presently known as Tochi Scouts provides the **Research Model**. Its present strength of 3150 men from eleven different tribes gives scientific data of figures in the field of health, wealth, discipline, mental prowess, sports, examination, and bravery. Its records are update and accessible; only at MiranShah. Around this data and personal observation including interviews with varying tribes, thereby gaining an access to their culture and philosophy. Fieldwork, Inductive, Logical Reasoning, Observation, and Intuition becomes the main tool in understanding the past and present. Culture emerges as the main thread. MiranShah acted as the cardinal thread in Research Model, it has changed very little since 1900, everyday life of militia, army and natives. Present events up till December 2012 are taken as the end point, after which the data interpretation started and finally emerged the predictions about the future. In

---

<sup>33</sup> Peter T Manes A History & Philosophy of The Social sciences, 1987, Basil Blackwell, Oxford. P-62

<sup>34</sup> P-63, *ibid*.

2014 the American announced the termination of War on Terror and Pakistan Army launched an operation in North Waziristan Agency, these two events acts as the natural jury of the findings of this thesis.

According to Constructivism and Hermeneutic , the behaviour of the humans is determined by their identity which itself is shaped by the society's values, history, practices and institutions, Constructivism holds that all institutions including the state are socially constructed, thus constructivism is a theory based upon observations and scientific study, it says people construct their own understanding and knowledge of the world through experiencing things and reflecting on those experiences. When we encounter something new we have to reconcile it with our previous ideas and experiences, maybe changing what we believe or may be discarding the new information as irrelevant.

## **5. Potential Contribution to Knowledge.**

The literature review reveals that so far no Doctorate level research has ever been carried in North Waziristan Agency. The concept of Militia in tribal areas of Pakistan and meaning of Militia in Canada, United Kingdom and in America are almost poles apart; it is in etymological manner that the Militia as people army is generally understood in academic world. The Militia in Pakistan is the key player in the ongoing War on terror, it is recruited from the tribes in tribal areas which for generations are joining it and they therefore are models to narrate the history.

From a research point of view, the conduct of research in the tribal areas of Pakistan in time of such war on terror adds new dimension to methodology. In the past, during the Russian invasion of Afghanistan, the interaction was carried out with the non-residents or non-tribal people by the tribesmen, yet even then the role of Militia was never a subject of interest.

## **6. Limitation on Research in Tribal Areas**

After 9/11 and especially after the army taking control of operations in July 2005, which lead to increase in army led operations in tribal areas; all those associated with army or military

were seen with great suspicion by the natives, in many cases uniform personal were killed while on leave in their respective tribal areas or while being enroute. In order to understand the reasons for ongoing violence in North Waziristan and in other tribal areas of Pathans, the researcher cannot live with all segments of society or the tribe for many reasons, the chief being the security, followed by culture.<sup>35</sup> Unlike West, where any scholar from tribal areas will be culturally accommodated among the women and men in a pub or in a park, without raising of any eye brow, no such liberty is available in tribal areas of Pakistan. Even to get into the mindset of the men in North Waziristan, was and still is an uphill task, the suspicion of being a spy is in the back of the mind of both. There is public transport but it is highly risky as the many instances of it being hijacked and only scholarly looking and government persons being slaughtered.<sup>36</sup>

The other major limitation is the official stance, and mind set of the military where any word in favour of tribes is taken as a sympathiser of Taliban and hence an anti-state and anti-army person. Same holds true for highlighting American actions in the conflict. Financial aspect is another important factor, this study is not funded by any grant or stipend. Last but not the least is the non-access to paid journals from the university library.<sup>37</sup> Morality and ethics have to be kept in mind while carrying out research in tribal areas, as a researcher one spends time with the militia, army and natives and as such one comes across quite a confidential material which has to be analysed and presented without compromising the reputation of the individual and his tribe or regiment.

---

<sup>35</sup> Evan Luard Edited, *The International Regulations of Frontier Dispute* {Thames, London, 1970} p-16.

<sup>36</sup> A summary of casualties suffered by Frontier Corps highlights that no less than 9% casualties have been suffered when the troops were on leave or while coming back from leave. Most affected were the Waziristan area.

<sup>37</sup> National Defence University does not have student accommodation and neither it had any anti-virus as late as 2016.

<sup>i</sup>Immanuel Kant {1724-1804} '*On History*<sup>i</sup>' edited by Lewis White Beck, translated by Lewis White Beck and Robert Anchor and Emil L.Fackenheim {NewYork: Bobbs Merrill,1963}.Immanuel Kant {1724-1804} '<sup>i</sup>' is more famous for his ' Critique of pure Reason' and also the ' Critique of practical Reason', his first writing was in 1784, his two essays 'what is enlightenment' and 'idea of a universal history from a cosmopolitan point of view'. What is enlightenment is the name of the essay and he went on to describe 'enlightenment is man's reliance from his self-incurred tutelage, which is man's inability to make use of his understanding without direction from another. Self incurred is this tutelage when its causes lies not in lack of reason but in lack of resolution and courage to use it without direction from another.

<sup>ii</sup> Old Testament {Bible} Birth, I-25. Also known as The First Book of Moses Called Genesis.

<sup>iii</sup> World population in 2011 was estimated as 7 billion with Pakistan ranked No 6 with 166 million population "*World Demographics Profile 2011*". *Index Mundi*. Retrieved November 18, 2011. Almost 45% of world population believes in the theory of creation {Jews, Christians and Muslims}<http://redcresearch.ie/wp-content/uploads/2012/08/RED-C-press-release-Religion-and-Atheism-25-7-12.pdf>

<sup>iv</sup> Charles Loomis , Zona Loomis. *Modern Social Theories selected American Writers*. {NewYork:Nostrad, 1961 }

<sup>v</sup>Marc Bloch *The Historian Craft*, translated. Peter Putnam.{NewYork: Alfred Knopf,1963}.

<sup>vi</sup> Karl R Popper *Poverty of Historicism* Boston, Beacon Press, 1957. The fundamental debate which Popper stated, is that there can be no laws prediction of human of the course of human history by scientific or any other rational method. The paper was first read in January 1936 and Popper dedicated his book 'to the countless men and women of all creed or nation or races who felt victims to the fascist and communist belief in inexorable laws of historical destiny'. Popper argues in his book in a logical manner first putting the logic and doctrine and arguments of those historians who believe that history can also have laws like the physics and later in the book Popper gives the other side arguments, that there can be no laws applicable in history as in physics. Popper in his introduction to the book , p-5.

<sup>vii</sup> Karl Jaspers, *The Origins and Goal of History* ,{NewHaven: Yale University,1953}

<sup>viii</sup> *Oxford Advance Learners Dictionary of Current English VII* edition,, , Karachi, Oxford, 2005.

<sup>ix</sup> Harry Shaw *Dictionary of LiteraryTerms*, New York, McGraw Hill, 1972.

<sup>x</sup> *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences* , David L.Sills editor {J.H.Hexter wrote it} Mcmillian, 1968.

<sup>xi</sup> Lester Stephen . *Probing the past a guide to the study of and teaching history*.{Boston: Allyn & Bacon. 1974},p.5.

<sup>xii</sup> Benedetto Croce., *History,its Theory and Practice*, trans. Douglas Ainslie .{NewYork:Russell,1960},p-12.

<sup>xiii</sup> Kelley, Donald. *Faces of History, Historical inquiry from Herodotus to Herder*. {London: Yale university Press,1998}, p-194.

<sup>xiv</sup> Historicism, the analysis and explanations of various differences between the various sociological doctrines and schools

<sup>xv</sup> Collingwood Richard 'The Nature and aim of a Philosophy of History' first published in 1924-1925 in *Essays in the Philosophy of History* {University of Texas:1967},p.36.

<sup>xvi</sup> Ibid, the Philosophy of History , leaflet of historical Association No.79, {1930}

<sup>xvii</sup> Arnold Jhonson,. *The Historian and historical Evidence*{NewYork: Charles Scribner 1926},p.33

<sup>xviii</sup> Alan Munslow, *A History of History* ,{London:Routledge,2012},pp.37-44.

<sup>xix</sup> The term use to describe them are 'cultural studies' 'past structuralism' 'past modernism' 'past colonialism' 'linguistic turn' 'cultural turn'.

<sup>xx</sup> Aristotle, *Metaphysics, Book A {1}*, 980, p-689.

---

<sup>xxi</sup> The four causes which Aristotle highlighted are , Essence, for the ‘Why’ is reducible finally to the definition and ultimately ‘why’ is a cause and principle. Second, is the matter or substratum , third is the source of change and fourth is the cause opposed to change. *Metaphysics*, p-693.

<sup>xxii</sup> Aristotle, *Metaphysics*, p-712.

## **Bibliography related to Philosophy Research and Theory**

Anthony, Elliot. *Routledge Companion to Social Theory*. London: Routledge,2010.

Babbie,Earl. *The practice of Social Research* 10<sup>th</sup> edition.New Delhi: Thomson,2006.

Bechhoffer Frank, Lindsay Patterson. *Principles of Social Research Design in the Social Sciences*. London: Routledge,2000.

Coleman,James. *Foundations of Social Theory*. Cambridge: Harvard University,1990.

Colton,David, Robert Covert. *Designing and Constructing Instruments for Social Research and evaluation*. San Francisco: John Wiley,2007.

Dawson, Michael. *Understanding Cognitive Science*, Oxford: Blackwell,1998

Durkheim, Emile. *The Rules of Sociological Method and selected Texts on Sociology and its Methods*, ed Steven Lukes, translated William Halls. London: Macmillian,1982.

Elliot,Aden,,ed. *The Routledge Companion to Social Theory*. London:Routledge,2010.

Foran, John,ed, *Theorising Revoloutions*. London: Routledge,1997.

Farrell Theo, *The Norms of War, Cultural Beliefs and Modern Conflict* {Lynne Rienner, Colorado,2006}

Gillham, Bill. *Observation Techniques structured to unstructured*. London: Continuum, 2008.

Giri, Ananta. *Creative Social research rethinking theories and methods*. Delhi:Vistaar,2004.

Gary Goertz and Jack S Levy. *Explaining War and Peace , case studies and Necessary condition counterfactuals* {Routledge, Abington,2007

Harris,Charles. *Fundamental Concepts and The sociological Enterprise* .London: Croom,1980.

Hans Morgenthau ‘Political Power and International Morality ‘in *The Morality of War*, A Reader. Ed, David Kinsella & Craig L.Carr { Viva, Delhi,2008, Indian Edition}

Hennick,Monique, Inge Hutter, Ajay Bailey. *Qualitative Research Methods*. New Delhi: Sage,2011.

Hymann, Herbert, Gene Levine, Charles Wright. *Inducing Social change in Developing Communities an international survey of expert advice*. United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Hobhouse ,Lawrence. *Sociology and Philosophy a centenary collection of essays and articles*. London: London School of Economics. 1966.

Hollis,Martin. *The Philosophy of Social Science an introduction*. Cambridge:2007 fifth edition {1984}.

- 
- Inkeles,Alex.,ed. *Readings on Modern Sociology*. New Jersey: Perentice-Hall,1966.
- Klein, Josephine. *The Study of Groups*. London: Routledge & Kegan, 1956.
- Kumar,Ranjit. *Research Methodology a step by step guide for beginners*. New Delhi: Pearson,2005 second edition.
- Loomis, Charles, Zona Loomis. *Modern Social Theories selected American writers*. London: Van Nostrad,1961.
- Maciver, Richard. *The elements of Social Science*. London: Methuen, first edition 1921.
- Myrdal, Gunnar. *Value in Social Theory* ed, Paul Streeten, London: Routledge, 1958.
- Marx, Karl. *Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right*, ed, Joseph O'Malley, trans, Annette Jolin and Joseph O'Malley. Cambridge: 1970.
- Neuman Lawrence. *Social Research Methods qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Fourth Edition Sydney: Allyn & Bacon, 1991.
- Plato. *The Dialogues of Plato* translated Michael Jowett. NewYork: Random,1937.
- Plato. *Republic*. Translation Robin Waterfield. NewYork: Barnes & Noble,1993.
- Russell Bertrand ‘*Philosophy of Logical Atomism*’ in *Logic and Knowledge Essays 4<sup>th</sup> edition*, ed,Charles Marsh, { London,
- Richard Mckeon,ed, *Basic Works of Aristotle*. NewYork: Random House, 1968.
- Scarbrough, Elinor. Eric Tanenbaum. Ed, *Research Strategies in the Social Science*. Oxford,1998.
- Stirk,Peter. *Critical Theory,Politics and Society an introduction*.London:Casell,2000.
- Tiwari,Ramakanth, Mahesh Dabhade. *Research in Social Sciences*. New Delhi: Commonwealth,2008.
- Toennies,Ferdinand. *On sociology, Pure, Applied and Empirical*, selected writings, Ed, Werner Cahman and Rudolf Herrier. University of Chicago,1961.
- Watson, Peter. *Ideas a history from fire to Freud*. London: Phoenix,2005.
- Wellington, Jerry , Marcin Szczerbinski. *Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. London: Viva-Continuum,2008.
- Weber,Max. *From Max Weber Essays in Sociology* , translated and edited Henry Gerth and Wright Mills. London: Routledge,6<sup>th</sup> edition.1967.